

European Union

WOB value

► EU: Governments resist to reveal positions

2 5 / 0 5  
2 0



**EU member states do not take yes for an answer. A fresh pro-transparency court ruling is repeatedly challenged by the Council of ministers.**

Yes, the public has a right to know the positions of EU member states before final decisions are made. This was the bottom line in a ruling by the General Court of the EU in 22 March in a case raised by Access-Info, a network and information centre based in Madrid. No, we won't accept that, a majority of governments replies. Less than two months after the pro-transparency ruling the Council of ministers decided to appeal the ruling to the Court of Justice, the highest instance of the EU-courts in Luxembourg. The formal decision was taken at a Council meeting in May 13,

with no member state voting against.

But this seemingly unanimous appeal might be challenged at a later stage, this website has learned. Pro-transparency governments do not object to have the case brought to a final ruling, but have reserved their right so side with Access-Info when the wording of the appeal is known. At the same time the Council has refused to accept the preliminary ruling in at least two ongoing cases of access to documents.

In a case concerning deliberations of a directive for the protection of soil, a "progress report" (see under Documents) regarding the proposal has been made public but with all national positions blanked out. The applicant César Nicolás Cuevas has asked for a full release of the document, referring to the ruling of the Access-Info case.

A majority of member states objects to a full release: *"(...) the Council considers that, on balance, all possible factors which would at the present stage, plead on favour of releasing document 6124/1/10 REV in its entirety are outweighed by the need to protect the Council's decision-making process."* Three member countries had a different opinion when the case was discussed at a working party meeting 20 May: Denmark abstained from voting, as did Finland adding that the Finnish positions on the soil directive may be released. Sweden also accepted to release its own positions, and added: *"Sweden finds that the reply does not sufficiently clarify how the interpretation of Article 4(3) as laid down in case T-233/09 (Access Info Europe v. Council) has been taken into account. Therefore, Sweden cannot agree with the reply."* (For the working party report - see under Documents)

On top of the appeal of the Access-Info case, and the refusal to release a full document on the soil directive a third case (Ronny Patz v. Council) is being discussed along similar lines. It is not yet known whether the Council in the Patz case sticks to an outright refusal, or if the arguments are more developed than in the Cuevas case. Documents concerning the Patz case are not accessible at the time of writing.

Staffan Dahllöf

Tags: 1049/2001 | Access-Info Europe | Sensitive documents | Wob international | Legal news

SHARE

Related

- 22/03/2011 EU: Court rules citizens have a right to know
- 19/04/2011 EU: Use Google, the Commission suggests as the debate on access gets heated
- 07/04/2011 EU: Access rules coming closer to a crossroad

Documents

- Protection of soil.pdf
- Quevas case.pdf

Wobbling.eu recommends

- Videos of Summer School online. 29/08 - 14:01 | FPD Feed
- Algemeen Directeur Peter Quaghebeur verlaat VMB. 26/08 - 16:10 | FPD Feed
- Opleidingsprogramma Journalistiek Arteveldehogeschool 2011-2012.

FOI community

- Blacklist: Armenian NGO 'names and shames' officials neglecting media - Human rights | ArmeniaNow.com. 14/07 - 15:58 | Wob Community
- Dealing with the FOI deluge | Guardian Government Computing | Guardian Professional. 13/07 - 16:08 | Wob Community

Tweets

- robevansguardia: RT @JasonNParkinson: The #EDL set light to a colleague today in the Tower Hamlets protest. He has suffered minor burns. 05/09 - 13:30 | United Kingdom - David Leigh
- robevansguardia: RT @JasonNParkinson: The #EDL set light to a colleague today in the Tower Hamlets protest. He has suffered minor burns. 05/09 - 13:30 | United Kingdom - David Leigh

25/08 - 15:50 | FPD Feed

- [Nominaties voor De Loep 2011](#)   
22/08 - 17:15 | FPD Feed
- [Do you have a European story that goes across borders, and do you need a bit of extra support to carry it out? Then maybe Journalismfund.eu can help you with a research grant.](#)   
18/08 - 10:45 | FPD Feed

[Go to the archive](#)

- [ALTER-EU reaction to the newly launched joint lobby register: "Transparency Register" does not yet live up to its name](#) | ALTER-EU  
28/06 - 10:22 | Web Community
- [Wikileaks among topics at First Global Conference on Transparency Research in Newark](#) | International | New JerseyNewroom.com -- Your State. Your News.   
25/05 - 09:54 | Web Community
- [Named and Shamed: Media NGO blacklists officials breaching information rights - Human rights](#) | ArmeniaNow.com   
13/05 - 21:52 | Web Community

[Go to the archive](#)

06/09 - 13:30 | United Kingdom - Rob Evans

- [rosenbaum6: MI @sallygainsbury: FT analysis maps Ldn riots by suspect homes](#) <http://t.co/Gq2ZAVd>  and <http://t.co/3wUHNU>   
05/09 - 12:24 | United Kingdom - Martin Rosenbaum
- [rosenbaum6: RT @BBCBryCJ: Here's the FOI data on government software spending, as a Google Doc](#) <http://t.co/ok9bc14>   
05/09 - 12:18 | United Kingdom - Martin Rosenbaum
- [robevanguardia: How Tony Blair was taken into the Murdoch family fold](#) <http://t.co/DOx7ytk>  via @guardian  
05/09 - 12:17 | United Kingdom - David Leigh

[Go to the archive](#)

### Web per country

- |                  |           |               |               |
|------------------|-----------|---------------|---------------|
| • Albania        | • Estonia | • Kosovo      | • Poland      |
| • Austria        | • Finland | • Latvia      | • Portugal    |
| • Belgium        | • France  | • Lithuania   | • Romania     |
| • Bosnia         | • Germany | • Luxembourg  | • Serbia      |
| • Britain        | • Greece  | • Macedonia   | • Slovakia    |
| • Bulgaria       | • Hungary | • Malta       | • Slovenia    |
| • Croatia        | • Iceland | • Montenegro  | • Spain       |
| • Cyprus         | • Ireland | • Netherlands | • Sweden      |
| • Czech Republic | • Italy   | • Norway      | • Switzerland |
| • Denmark        |           |               |               |

### Web international

- Council of Europe
- European Union
- World Bank

Wobbling Europe is a project by the Pascal Decroos Fund, an independent non-profit association registered in Belgium (vzw/asbl).

#### Contact

Wobbling Europe  
Rozenweg 4b  
B-1731 Zellik  
Belgium



#### Follow us on



#### Partners



Disclaimer | site by 2Mpac